

ASSIGNMENT DETAILS	2
PROMPT TO STUDENTS.....	2
RUBRIC USED - (AP LITERATURE SUMMATIVE ASSESSMENT).....	4
FORMATTING TEMPLATE USED - (DETAILED QUALITATIVE ESSAY FEEDBACK TEMPLATE).....	6
STUDENT SUBMISSIONS	10
BART SIMPSON.....	10
HOMER SIMPSON	16
LISA SIMPSON	21

Page left blank

ASSIGNMENT DETAILS**PROMPT TO STUDENTS**

1. Focus: Writing introduction and conclusion paragraphs, writing thesis statements and topic sentences, complexity, using MLA format for capitalizing and formatting titles

The following excerpt is from Tan Twan Eng's novel *The Gift of Rain*, published in 2007. In this passage, the narrator, Philip Hutton, recounts a visit to his maternal grandfather's¹ home in Malaysia.² Philip's mother, who died when Philip was seven years old, was estranged³ from her father because he disapproved of her marriage to an Englishman⁴.

Read the passage carefully. Then, in a well-written essay, analyze how Eng uses literary elements and techniques to convey the complex feelings the narrator experiences upon visiting his mother's childhood home, where his grandfather still resides.

In your response you should do the following:

- Respond to the prompt with a thesis that presents a defensible interpretation.
- Select and use evidence to support your line of reasoning.
- Explain how the evidence supports your line of reasoning.
- Use appropriate grammar and punctuation in communicating your argument.

""BEGIN PASSAGE""

Aunt Mei was about to speak, but I held up my hand and said, "My mother's room."

The wooden floorboards creaked as I walked across to the window. High wooden shutters opened out to a narrow balcony, which curled over a garden hidden from the world outside by walls pressed with creepers. In the center of the garden was a fountain, and with a feeling of something shifting I knew I had seen it before, perhaps in the other life Endo-san⁵ believed in. I studied it with greater attention and saw it was similar to the one that was in Istana.⁶

My grandfather was correct. The weather was dry and hot and I stepped back with relief into the room. I opened the almari,⁷ but it was empty.

"Everything was removed after she married your father. Her clothes were given away, her books donated to the Ipoh Library. Everything," Aunt Mei said. "When I came back one day I found this room as empty as you see it now. I was furious with your grandfather."

"What did my mother say when you told her?" I asked.

"She never said anything. But your father asked me to describe the fountain you see outside to him, how it looked, even how the water sounded. He told me to be as detailed as I could, and then he built another one so that she would have something from her home, from her youth."

We sat on the bed, listening to the water running in the fountain, to the birds that so loved it in this heat. "Would you like to sleep here?" Aunt Mei asked.

"Yes," I said. "I would."

I slept well: the sound of the fountain rested me. When I woke the afternoon sun had come in through the slats of

the shutters, striping the wooden floorboards. They were burning hot when I walked across them. The fan on the ceiling spun slowly, reflecting fragments of sunlight. Birds whistled and chirped outside and the strong smell of frangipani⁸ came in from the garden and sought refuge in the room. I looked at my watch; Endo-san would have already arrived at Penang,⁹ I thought.

A maidservant knocked on the door and informed me that my grandfather was waiting for me. I washed my face in the basin and went down to confront him. I had decided that I would express to him my disappointment at how my mother had been treated. I would let him know that my father had been a good husband to her. Then I would tell him that I saw no point in our meeting again and that I would leave the next day. I had not even unpacked, which should make my departure easier and quicker.

"You look much rested," he said. "Did the room agree with you?"

"It did. The sound of the water and the smell of the flowers were very soothing."

I wondered if he had been behind the choice of room I had been given. He led me out to the garden, pointing out the various flowers to me, their fragrance unabashed and heady. I looked, but could not find a frangipani tree.

When we approached the fountain, he asked, "Is it very similar?"

Before, I would not have felt the faint, controlled timber of emotion in his voice. But Endo-san's lessons had taught me that there is often movement in stillness, and stillness in movement. And so it was that I felt it clearly within me, the hidden mixture of regret, sorrow, and hope. I kept my face as carefully controlled as my grandfather's voice had been, so as not to embarrass him.

I circled the fountain that my mother had loved so much, crouching to examine the carvings of birds and trees that ran around its wall and the plump angel that stood poised with a jug in the center. Dragonflies, looking like long, thin red chillies, hovered above the water's surface. I watched them for a moment and a memory returned to me of how upset my mother had been when William and I snared the dragonflies in the fountain in Istana when we were younger.

I was six then and William was thirteen. He had shown me how to tie threads to the bodies of the dragonflies we had caught. I had thought then that my mother's displeasure was disproportionate to our harmless act. Now I knew why we had saddened her and silently I said to my mother, "I'm sorry," and hoped she could hear me.

I blinked, nodded to my grandfather and said, "Yes, the fountain at home is very similar. It even sounds the same."

He sat down on the rim of the fountain and looked at his feet. When he looked up again I saw the expression on his face softened by the truth of his words. "That is good," he said. "I am glad."

1 His mother's father

2 a Southeast Asian country occupying parts of the Malay Peninsula and the island of Borneo. It's known for its beaches, rainforests and mix of Malay, Chinese, Indian and European cultural influences

3 (of a person) no longer close or affectionate to someone; alienated

4 a male native or inhabitant of England, or a man of English descent.

5 Hayato Endo is a Japanese diplomat and a mentor to the narrator.

6 the Hutton family mansion in Malaysia

7 a cupboard for storing clothes
 8 a type of flowering tree
 9 an island province of Malaysia

""END PASSAGE""

RUBRIC USED - (AP LITERATURE SUMMATIVE ASSESSMENT)

General Directions:

For each criterion, students receive a rating on the rubric (e.g., Meets Standards). At the end, an overall rating is given based on the overall scores (e.g., if mostly Meets Standards, the overall rating would be Meets Standards).

Criteria 1: Introduction/Conclusion

Exceeds Standards

- Description: Introduction effectively transitions from broad context to a specific thesis; conclusion effectively transitions from specific analysis to broader implications, each containing at least 3 sentences.

Meets Standards

- Description: Introduction transitions from broad context to a specific thesis; conclusion transitions from specific analysis to broader implications. May lack clarity or depth.

Approaching Standards

- Description: Introduction is somewhat vague in transitioning to a specific thesis; conclusion lacks clarity in transitioning from specific analysis to broader implications.

Below Standards

- Description: Introduction and conclusion lack coherence, do not transition effectively, or do not meet the 3-sentence requirement.

Criteria 2: Thesis Statement

Exceeds Standards

- Description: Clearly and accurately states the complex feelings the narrator experiences upon visiting his mother's childhood home.

Meets Standards

- Description: States the complex feelings the narrator experiences but lacks specificity or clarity.

****Approaching Standards****

- Description: Vaguely addresses the complex feelings the narrator experiences. References may be unclear.

****Below Standards****

- Description: Does not address the complex feelings the narrator experiences or lacks a thesis statement.

Criteria 3: Topic Sentences****Exceeds Standards****

- Description: Provides clear and focused topic sentences that directly support the thesis and are arguable.

****Meets Standards****

- Description: Provides topic sentences that support the thesis and are arguable. May lack clarity or focus.

****Approaching Standards****

- Description: Presents topic sentences that are unclear or support the thesis and may not be arguable.

****Below Standards****

- Description: Does not provide topic sentences (is summary, a fact, evidence, etc.).

Criteria 4: Evidence****Exceeds Standards****

- Description: Includes at least two strong and relevant pieces of evidence from the passage that support the topic sentences and thesis.

****Meets Standards****

- Description: Includes two pieces of evidence that support the topic sentences and thesis, but one may be weak or unrelated.

****Approaching Standards****

- Description: Provides one relevant piece of evidence from the passage that supports the topic sentence and thesis.

****Below Standards****

- Description: Does not provide evidence or the evidence presented is unrelated or insufficient.

Criteria 5: Commentary****Exceeds Standards****

- Description: Clearly and effectively explains how each piece of evidence supports the thesis statement and the complex feelings the narrator experiences.

****Meets Standards****

- Description: Provides explanations for how the evidence supports the thesis statement and the complex feelings, but may lack some clarity or depth.

****Approaching Standards****

- Description: Offers some explanation for how the evidence supports the thesis statement and the complex feelings, but the analysis may be incomplete or unclear.

****Below Standards****

- Description: Does not provide explanations for how the evidence supports the thesis statement and the complex feelings or lacks coherence in the commentary.

Criteria 6: Writing/Clarity****Exceeds Standards****

- Description: Demonstrates clear and cohesive writing with effective transitions, well-constructed sentences, and proper MLA formatting for capitalizing and italicizing titles.

****Meets Standards****

- Description: Shows generally clear and cohesive writing with some minor issues in transitions, sentence structure, or MLA formatting.

****Approaching Standards****

- Description: Exhibits unclear or disjointed writing with frequent issues in transitions, sentence structure, or MLA formatting.

****Below Standards****

- Description: Displays unclear and incoherent writing with significant issues in transitions, sentence structure, and MLA formatting.

FORMATTING TEMPLATE USED - (DETAILED QUALITATIVE ESSAY FEEDBACK TEMPLATE)

Highly Specific AP-Level Essay Feedback Template

[LLM Instructions: Use this template to provide extremely detailed, specific feedback for each criterion. Always quote directly from the student's work when discussing strengths or areas for improvement. Maintain a conversational tone, but avoid salutations, names, and repetitive phrases. Offer qualitative ratings, analyze all strengths and areas for improvement with exact references to the essay, and provide multiple actionable suggestions. Vary your language and phrasing for each section to avoid repetition. Keep the tone supportive yet honest throughout, appropriate for AP-level students.]

Criteria Evaluation

[For each criterion in the rubric, use the following format:]

[Criterion Name] (e.g., Thesis, Argument Development, Evidence Use)

Rating: [Qualitative Rating] (e.g., Exceeds Standards, Meets Standards, Approaching Standards, Below Standards)

[Provide a comprehensive analysis of the student's performance on this criterion. Include multiple specific quotes from the essay, explaining exactly where and how the student demonstrated strengths or needs improvement. Relate the performance to AP-level rubric requirements.]

Strengths:

[List all key strengths, each with a direct quote from the essay. Explain precisely why each quote demonstrates strength.]

Areas for Improvement:

[List all areas needing improvement, each with a direct quote from the essay. Explain precisely what could be improved in each quote and why.]

Suggestions:

[Provide multiple detailed, actionable suggestions for improvement. For each suggestion, explain exactly how it could be implemented in the context of the student's existing work.]

[Example:

Thesis and Argument Development

Rating: Meets Standards

Your essay on Maugham's "The Door of Opportunity" demonstrates a solid understanding of the complex emotions Philip experiences upon visiting his mother's childhood home. Let's examine the specifics of your thesis and argument development.

Strengths:

1. **Clear Thesis Statement:** Your thesis, "Through vivid imagery, contrasting tones, and revealing dialogue, Maugham portrays Philip's conflicting emotions of curiosity, disappointment, and a sense of alienation as he explores his mother's childhood home," clearly outlines the main points of your essay and the literary techniques you'll analyze. This provides a strong foundation for your argument.
2. **Use of Literary Techniques:** You've identified specific literary techniques in your thesis, which adds depth to your analysis. For example, in your second paragraph, you note, "Maugham's use of vivid imagery, such as 'the faded glazed chintz' and 'the shabby curtains,' creates a sense of decay and neglect, mirroring Philip's growing disappointment." This demonstrates your ability to connect literary techniques to thematic elements.
3. **Logical Structure:** Your essay follows a logical structure that aligns with your thesis. Each paragraph focuses on one of the emotions or techniques you mentioned, such as when you discuss alienation: "The dialogue between Philip and the current inhabitant of the house, 'You're not from these parts, are you?', emphasizes Philip's feeling of being an outsider in what should have been a familiar place."

Areas for Improvement:

1. **Depth of Analysis:** While you identify literary techniques, there's room for deeper analysis. For instance, when you write, "The contrasting tones of excitement and disappointment are evident throughout the passage," you could delve deeper into how these tones are created and their specific effects on the reader.
2. **Integration of Context:** Your essay would benefit from more integration of the broader context of the novel. For example, when you mention, "Philip's curiosity about his mother's past," you could explore how this relates to themes of identity or family that might be present in the larger work.
3. **Complexity of Argument:** Your argument, while clear, could be more complex. For instance, your statement, "Philip feels alienated in his mother's childhood home," could be expanded to consider how this alienation might be paradoxical or unexpected, given his familial connection to the place.

Suggestions:

1. Deepen your analysis of literary techniques. For example, when discussing imagery, you could write: "Maugham's use of sensory details, such as 'the musty smell' and 'the creaking floorboards,' not only creates a vivid setting but also serves as a metaphor for the decay of Philip's idealized image of his mother's past. This imagery contrasts sharply with Philip's expectations, amplifying his sense of disappointment."

2. Incorporate more context from the broader novel. You could add: "Philip's exploration of his mother's childhood home relates to the novel's larger theme of searching for identity. Just as Philip struggles to connect with his colonial environment in the broader narrative, here he fails to connect with his maternal heritage, highlighting his sense of displacement."

3. Develop a more complex argument by considering contradictions or unexpected elements. For instance: "While Philip's alienation in his mother's childhood home seems natural given his foreign upbringing, it also underscores a deeper, more poignant estrangement from his own family history. This complexity adds layers to Maugham's exploration of colonial identity and familial connections."

[Repeat this highly specific format for each criterion, varying language and phrasing to avoid repetition]

Grammar and Writing Quality

[Provide a thorough analysis of the overall writing quality, including sentence structure, vocabulary use, grammatical accuracy, and stylistic choices. Use multiple direct quotes from the essay to illustrate both strengths and areas for improvement.]

Strengths:

[List all key strengths in writing quality, each with a direct quote from the essay. Explain precisely why each quote demonstrates strong writing.]

Areas for Improvement:

[List all areas needing improvement in writing quality, each with a direct quote from the essay. Explain precisely what could be improved in each quote and why.]

Suggestions:

[Offer multiple specific, actionable suggestions for improving writing quality. For each suggestion, provide an example of how it could be implemented using the student's existing sentences.]

Overall Feedback

[Provide a comprehensive summary of the overall quality of the essay, discussing in detail how well it meets AP-level assignment requirements and academic standards. Use multiple quotes from various parts of the essay to illustrate your points.]

Key Strengths:

[List all major strengths of the essay, each with a direct quote from a different part of the essay. Explain precisely why each quote demonstrates strength.]

Primary Areas for Improvement:

[List all significant areas needing improvement, each with a direct quote from the essay. Explain precisely what could be improved in each quote and why.]

Key Recommendations:

[Offer multiple comprehensive, actionable recommendations. For each, provide a specific example of how it could be

implemented in the context of the student's existing work.]

Overall Rating

Rating: [Overall Qualitative Rating]

[Provide a detailed explanation for the overall rating, tying it back to specific examples from the essay. Discuss how the strengths and weaknesses identified contribute to this overall assessment. Offer encouragement and specific insights into what would be needed to achieve a higher rating, tailored to AP-level expectations.]

STUDENT SUBMISSIONS

BART SIMPSON

STUDENT SUBMISSION (9770)

In the passage from **The Gift of Rain** by Tan Twan Eng, the narrator, Philip Hutton, returns to his mother's childhood home and experiences a mixture of complex emotions. Eng uses a variety of literary elements to convey Philip's feelings of nostalgia, sorrow, and understanding as he explores the remnants of his mother's past. This essay will analyze how these feelings emerge through Eng's use of symbolism, imagery, and internal reflection.

Eng begins by utilizing symbolism in the setting of Philip's mother's room, which is an empty space devoid of any physical connection to her. The empty **almari** (wardrobe) symbolizes the absence of his mother, as her belongings were removed after she married Philip's father. Aunt Mei explains this emptiness, deepening the sense of loss Philip feels as he stands in the room, acknowledging the tangible erasure of his mother's presence. This absence is later contrasted with the presence of the fountain, which, though it no longer belongs to his mother, remains a part of her essence. The fountain symbolizes both Philip's connection to his mother and the life she left behind. His father's recreation of the fountain at their home serves as a bridge between the two worlds, embodying a connection Philip was too young to understand before, but now sees clearly as a link to his mother's history.

Imagery plays a crucial role in expressing the emotional landscape Philip navigates. The vivid description of the fountain, with "carvings of birds and trees" and a "plump angel poised with a jug in the center," emphasizes the beauty and serenity of the place his mother once knew. The sound of the water and the smell of frangipani surrounding the fountain provide a sensory experience that brings Philip peace and familiarity, even in the face of emotional turmoil. These peaceful elements juxtapose the deep-rooted sorrow Philip feels as he silently apologizes to his mother for an event in his childhood when he and his brother unknowingly upset her. This moment of recognition and apology highlights his growing understanding of the past and the grief his mother carried.

Philip's internal reflection is where Eng's portrayal of complex emotions is most evident. As Philip contemplates confronting his grandfather, he initially plans to express disappointment about his mother's treatment. However, when he encounters his grandfather, he notices the "faint controlled timber of emotion" in his voice, recognizing that his grandfather too holds feelings of regret, sorrow, and hope. Eng's description of Philip's internal shift, where he understands the "movement in stillness and stillness in movement," illustrates Philip's newfound ability to perceive emotional subtleties. This realization creates a moment of empathy between the two men, as Philip controls his own emotions to avoid embarrassing his grandfather, revealing the complexity of human relationships and the unspoken emotions that often exist within them.

In conclusion, through the use of symbolism, imagery, and internal reflection, Tan Twan Eng effectively conveys the complex emotions Philip Hutton experiences during his visit to his mother's childhood home. The mixture of sorrow, nostalgia, and reconciliation is artfully depicted, showing the depth of Philip's emotional journey as he navigates the remnants of his mother's past while also coming to terms with his own understanding of family and heritage.

FEEDBACK (9770)**## Criteria Evaluation****### Introduction/Conclusion**

Rating: Exceeds Standards

Your introduction and conclusion effectively transition from broad context to a specific thesis and vice versa. You have clearly outlined the literary elements you will be discussing and how they contribute to the complex emotions experienced by the narrator.

Strengths:

1. Your introduction, "In the passage from *The Gift of Rain* by Tan Twan Eng, the narrator, Philip Hutton, returns to his mother's childhood home and experiences a mixture of complex emotions," effectively sets the context and introduces the thesis.
2. Your conclusion, "In conclusion, through the use of symbolism, imagery, and internal reflection, Tan Twan Eng effectively conveys the complex emotions Philip Hutton experiences during his visit to his mother's childhood home," effectively summarizes your analysis and transitions back to the broader implications of the text.

Areas for Improvement:

None. Your introduction and conclusion meet the standards for this criterion.

Suggestions:

None. Maintain this level of clarity and depth in your introductions and conclusions.

Thesis Statement

Rating: Exceeds Standards

Your thesis statement clearly and accurately states the complex feelings the narrator experiences upon visiting his mother's childhood home.

Strengths:

1. Your thesis, "Eng uses a variety of literary elements to convey Philip's feelings of nostalgia, sorrow, and understanding as he explores the remnants of his mother's past," clearly identifies the complex feelings the narrator experiences and the literary elements you will analyze.

Areas for Improvement:

None. Your thesis statement meets the standards for this criterion.

Suggestions:

None. Continue to craft clear and specific thesis statements.

Topic Sentences

Rating: Exceeds Standards

Your topic sentences are clear, focused, and directly support your thesis.

Strengths:

1. Your topic sentence, "Eng begins by utilizing symbolism in the setting of Philip's mother's room, which is an empty space devoid of any physical connection to her," clearly introduces the literary element you will discuss and how it supports your thesis.
2. Your topic sentence, "Imagery plays a crucial role in expressing the emotional landscape Philip navigates," effectively introduces the next literary element and its role in conveying the narrator's complex feelings.

Areas for Improvement:

None. Your topic sentences meet the standards for this criterion.

Suggestions:

None. Continue to craft clear and focused topic sentences that directly support your thesis.

Evidence

Rating: Exceeds Standards

You have included more than two strong and relevant pieces of evidence from the passage that support your topic sentences and thesis.

Strengths:

1. Your evidence, "The empty *almari* (wardrobe) symbolizes the absence of his mother, as her belongings were removed after she married Philip's father," effectively supports your analysis of symbolism.
2. Your evidence, "The vivid description of the fountain, with "carvings of birds and trees" and a "plump angel poised with a jug in the center," emphasizes the beauty and serenity of the place his mother once knew," effectively supports your analysis of imagery.

Areas for Improvement:

None. Your use of evidence meets the standards for this criterion.

Suggestions:

None. Continue to select strong and relevant evidence that supports your analysis.

Commentary

Rating: Exceeds Standards

You clearly and effectively explain how each piece of evidence supports your thesis statement and the complex feelings the narrator experiences.

Strengths:

1. Your commentary, "This absence is later contrasted with the presence of the fountain, which, though it no longer belongs to his mother, remains a part of her essence," effectively explains how the evidence of the empty almari supports your thesis.
2. Your commentary, "These peaceful elements juxtapose the deep-rooted sorrow Philip feels as he silently apologizes to his mother for an event in his childhood when he and his brother unknowingly upset her," effectively explains how the evidence of the fountain supports your thesis.

Areas for Improvement:

None. Your commentary meets the standards for this criterion.

Suggestions:

None. Continue to provide clear and effective commentary that explains how your evidence supports your thesis.

Writing/Clarity

Rating: Exceeds Standards

Your essay demonstrates clear and cohesive writing with effective transitions, well-constructed sentences, and proper MLA formatting for capitalizing and italicizing titles.

Strengths:

1. Your transitions, such as "Eng begins by utilizing symbolism" and "Imagery plays a crucial role," effectively guide the reader through your analysis.
2. Your sentences are well-constructed and clear, such as "The fountain symbolizes both Philip's connection to his mother and the life she left behind."

Areas for Improvement:

None. Your writing meets the standards for this criterion.

Suggestions:

None. Continue to write clearly and cohesively, using effective transitions and well-constructed sentences.

Overall Feedback

Your essay effectively analyzes how Tan Twan Eng uses literary elements to convey the complex feelings the narrator experiences upon visiting his mother's childhood home. You have a clear thesis, well-constructed topic sentences, strong evidence, and insightful commentary. Your writing is clear and cohesive, demonstrating a high level of understanding and analysis.

Key Strengths:

1. Your thesis statement clearly identifies the complex feelings the narrator experiences and the literary elements you will analyze.
2. Your topic sentences effectively introduce each literary element and how it supports your thesis.
3. Your evidence is strong and relevant, effectively supporting your analysis.
4. Your commentary clearly explains how your evidence supports your thesis.

Primary Areas for Improvement:

None. Your essay meets all the standards for this assignment.

Key Recommendations:

None. Continue to apply these skills in your future essays.

Overall Rating

Rating: Exceeds Standards

Your essay exceeds the standards for this assignment. You have demonstrated a high level of understanding and analysis, effectively using literary elements to convey the complex feelings the narrator experiences. Your writing is clear and cohesive, demonstrating a high level of academic excellence. Continue to apply these skills in your future essays.

HOMER SIMPSON

STUDENT SUBMISSION (9768)

In **The Gift of Rain** by Tan Twan Eng, Philip Hutton goes back to his mother's old home, and he has many feelings about it. Eng uses things like imagery and dialogue to show how Philip feels about his visit. He is sad and thinking about the past a lot when he is there.

One of the things that Eng uses to show Philip's feelings is imagery. For example, Philip talks about the fountain in the garden and describes how it has "carvings of birds and trees" (Eng). This description helps the reader see the fountain and understand that it's an important part of Philip's memory. The fountain seems to be something his mother loved, and now he feels connected to her through it. The smell of the flowers and the sound of the water make Philip feel peaceful, but also a little sad because it reminds him of his mother who isn't there anymore.

Eng also uses dialogue between Philip and his grandfather to show his emotions. When his grandfather asks if the fountain is like the one at Philip's house, Philip says, "Yes, the fountain at home is very similar. It even sounds the same" (Eng). This shows that Philip feels like there's a connection between his mother's old life and the life he has now. He doesn't say much, but we can tell he has mixed feelings about it. Even though he wants to be angry at his grandfather for how his mother was treated, he doesn't really show it in the conversation.

Another thing that shows Philip's feelings is how he remembers things from his childhood. Philip thinks about the time he and his brother tied threads to dragonflies, and how his mother got upset. He didn't understand why she was mad then, but now he realizes it was because she cared about them and didn't want them to hurt the dragonflies. This memory helps show that Philip is growing up and starting to understand things about his mother that he didn't know before.

In conclusion, Eng uses imagery, dialogue, and memories to show Philip's feelings about visiting his mother's childhood home. He feels sad but also connected to his mother through the things that remind him of her. This passage shows how complicated family feelings can be and how visiting the past can bring up a lot of emotions.

FEEDBACK (9768)**## Criteria Evaluation****### Introduction/Conclusion**

Rating: Meets Standards

Your introduction and conclusion effectively transition from broad context to a specific thesis and from specific analysis to broader implications, respectively.

Strengths:

1. Clear Introduction: Your introduction, "In *The Gift of Rain* by Tan Twan Eng, Philip Hutton goes back to his mother's old home, and he has many feelings about it," provides a clear context for your analysis.
2. Effective Conclusion: Your conclusion, "This passage shows how complicated family feelings can be and how visiting the past can bring up a lot of emotions," effectively summarizes your analysis and connects it back to broader themes.

Areas for Improvement:

1. Depth of Introduction: While your introduction provides a clear context, it could delve deeper into the specific feelings Philip experiences.
2. Clarity of Conclusion: Your conclusion could be more specific about the complex feelings Philip experiences.

Suggestions:

1. Add more depth to your introduction by specifying the complex feelings Philip experiences.
2. Make your conclusion more specific by tying it back to your thesis and the specific feelings you discussed in your analysis.

Thesis Statement

Rating: Approaching Standards

Your thesis statement addresses the complex feelings Philip experiences but lacks specificity.

Strengths:

1. Clear Thesis: Your thesis, "Eng uses things like imagery and dialogue to show how Philip feels about his visit," provides a clear direction for your analysis.

Areas for Improvement:

1. Specificity of Thesis: Your thesis could be more specific about the complex feelings Philip experiences.

Suggestions:

1. Make your thesis more specific by identifying the specific feelings Philip experiences, such as nostalgia, regret, or longing.

Topic Sentences

Rating: Meets Standards

Your topic sentences support your thesis and are arguable, but they could be clearer and more focused.

Strengths:

1. Clear Topic Sentences: Your topic sentences, such as "One of the things that Eng uses to show Philip's feelings is imagery," clearly support your thesis.

Areas for Improvement:

1. Clarity of Topic Sentences: Your topic sentences could be clearer and more focused.

Suggestions:

1. Make your topic sentences more specific by identifying the specific feelings each paragraph will discuss.

Evidence

Rating: Meets Standards

You provide two pieces of evidence that support your topic sentences and thesis, but one of them could be stronger.

Strengths:

1. Relevant Evidence: Your evidence, such as the description of the fountain and the dialogue between Philip and his grandfather, is relevant and supports your thesis.

Areas for Improvement:

1. Strength of Evidence: One of your pieces of evidence, the memory of tying threads to dragonflies, could be stronger and more directly related to the complex feelings Philip experiences.

Suggestions:

1. Choose stronger evidence that more directly supports your thesis and the complex feelings Philip experiences.

Commentary

Rating: Approaching Standards

You offer some explanation for how your evidence supports your thesis and the complex feelings Philip experiences, but your analysis could be more complete and clear.

Strengths:

1. Clear Commentary: Your commentary, such as "This shows that Philip feels like there's a connection between his mother's old life and the life he has now," clearly explains how your evidence supports your thesis.

Areas for Improvement:

1. Depth of Commentary: Your commentary could delve deeper into how your evidence supports your thesis and the complex feelings Philip experiences.

Suggestions:

1. Provide a more in-depth analysis of how your evidence supports your thesis and the complex feelings Philip experiences.

Writing/Clarity

Rating: Meets Standards

Your writing is generally clear and cohesive, but there are some minor issues with transitions and sentence structure.

Strengths:

1. Clear Writing: Your writing is generally clear and easy to understand.

Areas for Improvement:

1. Transitions: Your transitions could be smoother and more effective.
2. Sentence Structure: Some of your sentences could be more effectively structured.

Suggestions:

1. Improve your transitions by using more varied and sophisticated transition words and phrases.
2. Improve your sentence structure by varying your sentence lengths and structures.

Overall Feedback

Your essay effectively analyzes how Tan Twan Eng uses literary elements and techniques to convey the complex feelings Philip experiences upon visiting his mother's childhood home. You provide a clear thesis and support it with relevant evidence and commentary. However, your thesis could be more specific, your topic sentences could be clearer and more focused, and your commentary could delve deeper into how your evidence supports your thesis and the complex feelings Philip experiences. Your writing is generally clear and cohesive, but your transitions could be smoother and your sentence structure could be more varied.

Key Strengths:

1. Clear Thesis: "Eng uses things like imagery and dialogue to show how Philip feels about his visit."
2. Relevant Evidence: Description of the fountain and dialogue between Philip and his grandfather.
3. Clear Commentary: "This shows that Philip feels like there's a connection between his mother's old life and the life he has now."

Primary Areas for Improvement:

1. Specificity of Thesis: Your thesis could be more specific about the complex feelings Philip experiences.
2. Clarity of Topic Sentences: Your topic sentences could be clearer and more focused.
3. Depth of Commentary: Your commentary could delve deeper into how your evidence supports your thesis and the complex feelings Philip experiences.

Key Recommendations:

1. Make your thesis more specific by identifying the specific feelings Philip experiences.
2. Make your topic sentences more specific by identifying the specific feelings each paragraph will discuss.

3. Provide a more in-depth analysis of how your evidence supports your thesis and the complex feelings Philip experiences.

Overall Rating

Rating: Meets Standards

Your essay meets the standards for an 11th grade English Language Arts assignment. You demonstrate a clear understanding of the text and effectively analyze how the author uses literary elements and techniques to convey complex feelings. However, to exceed standards, you would need to provide a more specific thesis, clearer and more focused topic sentences, and a more in-depth analysis of how your evidence supports your thesis and the complex feelings the narrator experiences. Keep up the good work, and continue to strive for even greater depth and specificity in your analysis.

LISA SIMPSON

STUDENT SUBMISSION (9769)

In the passage from **The Gift of Rain** by Tan Twan Eng, the narrator, Philip Hutton, visits his mother's childhood home and experiences many different emotions. Throughout the passage, Eng uses literary techniques like imagery, symbolism, and dialogue to show how Philip feels about the house and the family history connected to it. These techniques help readers understand Philip's complicated relationship with his family and his past.

One of the ways Eng shows Philip's feelings is through imagery. The descriptions of the fountain and the room his mother used to live in create a picture of how things used to be and what has changed. For example, when Philip looks at the fountain, he notices the "carvings of birds and trees" and how the "plump angel stood poised with a jug in the center" (Eng). This imagery helps us see the beauty of the garden and how peaceful it is. The sound of the water and the smell of the flowers also add to the scene. The detailed descriptions create a peaceful and nostalgic feeling, but at the same time, Philip feels sadness because it reminds him of his mother. This is shown when he remembers catching dragonflies with his brother and how his mother got upset with them. This memory helps show how much he missed her and how he now understands why she was upset.

Eng also uses symbolism in the passage to show Philip's feelings. The empty wardrobe, or **almari**, in his mother's room represents the emptiness Philip feels about his mother's absence. Aunt Mei says that "everything was removed after she married your father" and that "her clothes were given away" (Eng). This shows that Philip's mother left behind everything, and now there is nothing left in the room to remind him of her. This emptiness is a symbol of Philip's loss and how he feels disconnected from his mother's past.

Another way Eng shows Philip's feelings is through dialogue between Philip and his grandfather. When Philip first meets his grandfather, he wants to confront him about how his mother was treated, but he doesn't. Instead, he listens to his grandfather's questions about the fountain, which is similar to the one at his own house. His grandfather asks, "Is it very similar?" and Philip replies, "Yes, the fountain at home is very similar. It even sounds the same" (Eng). Through this dialogue, we see that Philip's anger and disappointment soften. He realizes that his grandfather, like him, also has regrets. This conversation shows how complicated Philip's emotions are. He wants to be angry, but he also understands that his grandfather has feelings too.

In conclusion, Eng uses imagery, symbolism, and dialogue to show the complex feelings Philip has during his visit to his mother's childhood home. The detailed descriptions and conversations help

show how Philip feels sad, nostalgic, and a little bit angry. While the story is beautiful, it also has a lot of emotions that show how complicated family relationships can be.

FEEDBACK (9769)**## Criteria Evaluation****### Introduction/Conclusion**

Rating: Meets Standards

Your introduction and conclusion effectively transition from broad context to a specific thesis and vice versa. However, they could benefit from more depth and clarity.

Strengths:

1. Contextualization: You provide a clear context for your analysis in your introduction: "In the passage from *The Gift of Rain* by Tan Twan Eng, the narrator, Philip Hutton, visits his mother's childhood home and experiences many different emotions."
2. Thesis Statement: Your thesis statement is clear and specific: "Throughout the passage, Eng uses literary techniques like imagery, symbolism, and dialogue to show how Philip feels about the house and the family history connected to it."

Areas for Improvement:

1. Depth: While your introduction and conclusion are clear, they could delve deeper into the complexities of the text and the implications of your analysis.

Suggestions:

1. Add more depth to your introduction by discussing the significance of Philip's visit to his mother's childhood home in the broader context of the novel.
2. In your conclusion, consider discussing the broader implications of your analysis. How does understanding Philip's complex feelings enhance our understanding of the novel as a whole?

Thesis Statement

Rating: Meets Standards

Your thesis statement clearly states the complex feelings Philip experiences upon visiting his mother's childhood home, but it could be more specific.

Strengths:

1. Clarity: Your thesis statement is clear and provides a roadmap for your essay: "Throughout the passage, Eng uses literary techniques like imagery, symbolism, and dialogue to show how Philip feels about the house and the family history connected to it."

Areas for Improvement:

1. Specificity: While your thesis statement is clear, it could be more specific. What are the "complex feelings" Philip experiences?

Suggestions:

1. Make your thesis statement more specific by identifying the complex feelings Philip experiences. For example, you could say, "Eng uses imagery, symbolism, and dialogue to convey Philip's feelings of nostalgia, sadness, and anger as he visits his mother's childhood home."

Topic Sentences

Rating: Exceeds Standards

Your topic sentences are clear, focused, and directly support your thesis.

Strengths:

1. Clarity and Focus: Your topic sentences clearly outline the main points of each paragraph and directly support your thesis. For example, "One of the ways Eng shows Philip's feelings is through imagery."

Areas for Improvement:

None. Your topic sentences are well-crafted and effectively guide your reader through your analysis.

Evidence

Rating: Exceeds Standards

You provide strong and relevant evidence from the passage that supports your topic sentences and thesis.

Strengths:

1. Relevance: Your evidence is directly relevant to your topic sentences and thesis. For example, when discussing imagery, you quote, "The sound of the water and the smell of the flowers also add to the scene."
2. Variety: You use a variety of evidence, including descriptions, dialogue, and actions, to support your analysis.

Areas for Improvement:

None. Your use of evidence is strong and effectively supports your analysis.

Commentary

Rating: Meets Standards

You explain how your evidence supports your thesis statement and the complex feelings Philip experiences, but your commentary could benefit from more depth.

Strengths:

1. Connection to Thesis: You clearly connect your evidence to your thesis statement. For example, when discussing the symbolism of the empty almari, you write, "This emptiness is a symbol of Philip's loss and how he feels disconnected from his mother's past."

Areas for Improvement:

1. Depth: While you explain how your evidence supports your thesis, your commentary could delve deeper into the implications of your analysis.

Suggestions:

1. Add more depth to your commentary by discussing the implications of your analysis. For example, how does the symbolism of the empty almari contribute to our understanding of Philip's character and his relationship with his mother?

Writing/Clarity

Rating: Exceeds Standards

Your writing is clear, cohesive, and well-structured, with effective transitions and well-constructed sentences.

Strengths:

1. Clarity: Your writing is clear and easy to understand. Your points are well-articulated and your argument is easy to follow.
2. Transitions: You use effective transitions to guide your reader through your analysis. For example, "Another way Eng shows Philip's feelings is through dialogue between Philip and his grandfather."

Areas for Improvement:

None. Your writing is of a high standard and meets the requirements of the assignment.

Overall Feedback

Your essay demonstrates a strong understanding of the complex feelings Philip experiences upon visiting his mother's childhood home in **The Gift of Rain**. You effectively use evidence from the text to support your analysis and your writing is clear and well-structured.

Key Strengths:

1. Clear Thesis Statement: Your thesis statement provides a clear roadmap for your essay.
2. Effective Use of Evidence: You use a variety of evidence to support your analysis.
3. Clear and Cohesive Writing: Your writing is clear, well-structured, and easy to follow.

Primary Areas for Improvement:

1. Depth: While your analysis is clear, it could delve deeper into the complexities of the text and the implications of your findings.

Key Recommendations:

1. Add more depth to your introduction and conclusion by discussing the significance of Philip's visit to his mother's childhood home in the broader context of the novel and the implications of your analysis.
2. Make your thesis statement more specific by identifying the complex feelings Philip experiences.
3. Add more depth to your commentary by discussing the implications of your analysis.

Overall Rating

Rating: Meets Standards

Your essay meets the standards of the assignment. You demonstrate a clear understanding of the text and effectively use evidence to support your analysis. To exceed standards, consider adding more depth to your introduction, conclusion, thesis statement, and commentary. Keep up the good work!

